

Supplemental Materials to “Intervention, Bias, Responsibility... and the Trolley Problem”

Justin Sytsma and Jonathan Livengood

Study 1

Switch, Acts

A runaway trolley is headed toward five innocent people who are on the track and who will be killed unless something is done. Marcy is too far away to warn the people to get off the track, but she is standing next to a switch that she can flip to redirect the trolley onto a second track. If Marcy flips the switch, the five people on the original track will be saved. However, an innocent bystander is standing on the second track. If Marcy flips the switch, the trolley will hit and kill the bystander.

Marcy flips the switch, redirecting the trolley onto the second track. The trolley hits and kills the bystander, but not the five people.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

[given one of the following three statements]

Marcy acted morally.

Marcy is responsible for the death of the bystander.

Marcy caused the death of the bystander.

Switch, Refrains

[first paragraph same as *Switch, Acts*]

Marcy does not flip the switch and the trolley continues down the original track. The trolley hits and kills the five people, but not the bystander.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

[given one of the following three statements]

Marcy acted morally.

Marcy is responsible for the death of the five people.

Marcy caused the death of the five people.

Footbridge, Acts

A runaway trolley is headed toward five innocent people who are on the track and who will be killed unless something is done. Marcy is too far away to warn the people to get off the track, but she is standing on a footbridge that runs over the track. If Marcy dropped something heavy onto the track, it would stop the train and the five people would be saved. Unfortunately, Marcy is not heavy enough to stop the train. However, an innocent bystander is next to her on the footbridge and he is quite heavy. If Marcy pushes the bystander, he will fall onto the track and stop the trolley—being killed in the process—before it can hit the five people.

Marcy pushes the bystander. The trolley hits and kills the bystander, but is stopped before it can hit the five people.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

[given one of the following three statements]

Marcy acted morally.

Marcy is responsible for the death of the bystander.

Marcy caused the death of the bystander.

Footbridge, Refrains

[first paragraph same as *Footbridge, Acts*]

Marcy does not push the bystander. The trolley hits and kills the five people, passing under the bystander standing on the footbridge.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

[given one of the following three statements]

Marcy acted morally.

Marcy is responsible for the death of the five people.

Marcy caused the death of the five people.

Study 2

[given one of the four vignettes from Study 1]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with each of the following claims?

Marcy did the right thing.

Marcy is praiseworthy.

Marcy is blameworthy.

Overall, how would you evaluate Marcy's behavior?

1=Very Bad, 4=Neither Good nor Bad, 7=Very Good

Study 3

Switch, Acts

Tom is walking to the trolley station when he finds himself in a life and death situation: A runaway trolley is hurtling down the tracks toward five people. All five people will be killed if the trolley proceeds on its present course.

Tom is too far away to warn the people, and he has no way to stop the trolley. The only thing that he can do is to flip the switch next to him to divert the trolley onto a secondary track, which has a single person on it.

Tom is faced with a decision:

If he decides to flip the switch, the trolley will be diverted and the person on the secondary track will die.

If he decides to do nothing, the trolley will not be diverted and the five people on the original track will die.

Tom decides to flip the switch. The trolley is diverted onto the secondary track. The person on the track is hit and dies.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom caused the death of the person on the secondary track.

[second page]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with each of the following claims?

Tom made the correct decision.

Tom's decision was morally permissible.

If Tom had decided to do nothing, the five people on the original track would have died.

Switch, Refrains

[first five paragraphs same as *Switch, Acts*]

Tom decides to do nothing. The trolley proceeds down the original track. The five people on the track are hit and die.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom caused the death of the five people on the original track.

[second page]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with each of the following claims?

Tom made the correct decision.

Tom's decision was morally permissible.

If Tom had decided to flip the switch, the person on the secondary track would have died.

Footbridge, Acts

Tom is walking across a footbridge over a trolley track when he finds himself in a life and death situation: A runaway trolley is hurtling down the tracks toward five people. All five people will be killed if the trolley is not stopped.

Tom is too far away to warn the people. The only thing that he can do to stop the trolley is to push a large object over the railing and onto the track. Tom is too small to stop the trolley, but there is a bystander next to him who is large enough to stop the trolley.

Tom is faced with a decision:

If he decides to push the bystander onto the track, the trolley will be stopped, but the bystander will die.

If he decides to do nothing, the trolley will not be stopped and the five people on the track will die.

Tom decides to push the bystander onto the track. The bystander is hit and dies, stopping the trolley before it reaches the five people on the track.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom caused the death of the bystander.

[second page]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with each of the following claims?

Tom made the correct decision.

Tom's decision was morally permissible.

If Tom had decided to do nothing, the five people on the track would have died.

Footbridge, Refrains

[first five paragraphs same as *Footbridge, Acts*]

Tom decides to do nothing. The trolley is not stopped and the five people on the track are hit and die.

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom caused the death of the five people on the track.

[second page]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with each of the following claims?

Tom made the correct decision.
Tom's decision was morally permissible.
If Tom had decided to push the bystander onto the track, the bystander would have died.

Study 4

Switch, Acts

[vignette same as *Switch, Acts* from Study 3]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom's decision caused the death of the person on the secondary track.

[second page same as *Switch, Acts* from Study 3]

Switch, Refrains

[vignette same as *Switch, Refrains* from Study 3]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom's decision caused the death of the five people on the original track.

[second page same as *Switch, Refrains* from Study 3]

Footbridge, Acts

[vignette same as *Footbridge, Acts* from Study 3]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom's decision caused the death of the bystander.

[second page same as *Footbridge, Acts* from Study 3]

Footbridge, Refrains

[vignette same as *Footbridge, Refrains* from Study 3]

On a scale of 1-7, one being strongly disagree and seven being strongly agree, how much do you agree with the following claim?

Tom's decision caused the death of the five people on the track.

[second page same as *Footbridge, Refrains* from Study 3]